Peer Review

A. Michelle Lawing
Ecosystem Science and Management
Texas A&M University
College Station, TX 77843
alawing@tamu.edu
Why Peer Review

• Take responsibility for learning

• Learn to assess

• Engage material more deeply

• Peer review is not to help each other feel better

• It is to help each other improve the quality of your work

• Be critical and improve with criticism
Why Peer Review

• As a reviewer
  – Criticism should be constructive and respectful
  – Become comfortable with giving peer criticism

• As a writer
  – Decide which advice to take
  – Become comfortable with receiving peer criticism
Guidelines

• General comments are not useful
  – “I just didn’t get it”
  – “It’s great”

• Overly specific comments are also not helpful
  – Focusing on writers use of commas
  – Commenting excessively on a single topic at the exclusion of others

• Personal insults are unacceptable
  – “This is a stupid idea”
  – “How lame”
# Common Proofreading Symbols

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Symbol</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>Example</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>↑</td>
<td>insert a comma</td>
<td>The mayor’s brother, <em>I</em> tell you, is a crook.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>′</td>
<td>apostrophe or single quotation mark</td>
<td>I wouldn’t know where to put this vase.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✂</td>
<td>insert something</td>
<td><em>I</em> know it, in fact, everyone knows it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☹</td>
<td>use double quotation marks</td>
<td>My favorite poem is <em>Design</em>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▼</td>
<td>use a period here</td>
<td>This is a declarative sentence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✎</td>
<td>delete</td>
<td>The elephant’s trunk is really its nose.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↔</td>
<td>transpose elements</td>
<td>He only picked the one he likes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☠</td>
<td>close up this space</td>
<td>Jordan lost his favorite basketball.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>♫</td>
<td>a space needed here</td>
<td>I have only three friends: Ted, Raoul, and Alice.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>¶</td>
<td>begin new paragraph</td>
<td>“I knew it,” I said. “I thought so,” she replied.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☽</td>
<td>no paragraph</td>
<td>“I knew it, she said. No.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“He’s no good.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Completeness

• Rough-draft should be complete for peer review

• Others can't adequately review your work if it is not in complete form

• Bring two print copies to class
How to write a peer review

• Read each paper twice

• On the first pass mark up text as you go

• The second pass is for deeper understanding

• Follow rubric - link
Rubric

• Summary

• What works

• What doesn't

• Quality

• Response
Submitting reviews

• Author’s responsibility to submit two reviews with their work.

• If you do not follow some review suggestions, then need to address why on the review document.
Students’ Experiences

• “I’m getting mixed messages.”

• “Who am I to judge?”

• “The peers who read my paper never give me helpful feedback.”