Repeated trans-Atlantic dispersal catalysed a global songbird radiation
Gary Voelker1,* Sievert Rohwer2, Diana C. Outlaw1,3 and Rauri C. K. Bowie4

ABSTRACT

Aim Turdus thrushes are one of the most speciose and widespread songbird genera, comprising nearly 70 species that combined have a near-global distribution. Herein, we use molecular phylogenetic, molecular clock and behavioural evidence to examine the historical biogeography of the genus. Ancestral area reconstructions in conjunction with divergence estimates and palaeoclimatological data are used to test whether the long-standing paradigm of Beringian colonization or trans-Atlantic dispersal best explains modern distributions in the New and Old Worlds.

Location Worldwide, with emphasis on New World–Old World biotic interchange.

Methods Using a molecular phylogenetic hypothesis of Turdus thrushes, we reconstructed ancestral area relationships utilizing the five major continental or regional areas occupied by species in the genus. We also examined the evolution of behaviours on the phylogeny, and estimated the timing of major lineage divergences via a molecular clock.

Results Turdus originated in Eurasia, and following the colonization of Africa underwent a series of five trans-Atlantic sweepstake dispersals. The data reject the alternative hypothesis that connections between Old and New World Turdus species can be attributed to movement through Beringia with subsequent extinction. Divergence estimates indicate that these dispersals all occurred near the Miocene–Pliocene boundary, 5 Ma. A significant phylogenetic correlation between migratory and flocking behaviour is evident in the genus.

Main conclusions The initial divergence of Turdus in the Old World was followed by a series of trans-Atlantic sweepstake dispersal events. These dispersals are temporally correlated with a specific palaeoclimatic system, which would have facilitated transport of Turdus from the Caribbean to the Old World across the Atlantic. Uplift of the Central American Seaway 4.7 Ma effectively shut down the palaeoclimatic system, and no additional trans-Atlantic dispersals are evident in Turdus after this time. Migratory movements by ancestral lineages in flocks, rather than as single individuals, suggest an increased likelihood of successfully colonizing new areas, post-dispersal.

Keywords Behaviour, dispersal, divergence times, palaeoclimates, Pliocene, sweepstake colonization, vicariance.

INTRODUCTION

Trans-oceanic dispersal theories can accommodate any distribution or presumed set of relationships; this makes such theories resistant to rejection. Therefore dispersal theories have, rightfully, been regarded as unscientific or at least less parsimonious than vicariance-based theories (Rosen, 1978; Nelson & Platnick, 1981). Well-resolved molecular phylogenies of groups distributed on multiple continents have transformed trans-oceanic dispersal events (and dispersal theories generally) from hypotheses of last
resort into testable alternatives to vicariance as the primary engine of lineage divergence (Raxworthy et al., 2002; de Queiroz, 2005). For example, divergence dates and patterns of relationships within lineages often contradict the timing and sequence of plausible vicariant isolating events, leading to rejection of specific vicariant hypotheses (Bermingham et al., 1992; Klicka & Zink, 1997; Voelker, 1999; Heimicke et al., 2007; Pramuk et al., 2008; Trénel et al., 2007). In such cases, dispersal theories remain viable alternatives. Yet biogeographers have been reluctant to explain global distributions on the basis of trans-oceanic movements between continents because of the presumed rarity of successful sweepstake colonizations (colonization by chance events; Simpson, 1953). This presumption is grounded in two central issues. First is the inherent difficulty that individuals face in surmounting sweepstake barriers such as oceans, deserts or mountain ranges (Simpson, 1953), and second is the improbability that enough individuals can disperse across the barrier to ensure successful colonization (Humphries & Parenti, 1999). This ‘successful colonization conundrum’ is well reflected in songbird (and many other) lineages that post-date the initial break-up of Laurasia and Gondwanaland: thus far, the distributions of all songbird lineages found in both the Old and New World have been explained by trans-Beringian crossings, rather than trans-Atlantic crossings (Mayr, 1946; Voelker, 1999, 2002; Droveski et al., 2004).

The continued reluctance of biogeographers to explain avian distributions via oceanic dispersal is confounding for the simple reason that birds fly, and there is abundant evidence of birds colonizing remote volcanic islands. In general, few works have sought to identify extrinsic (e.g. palaeoclimates) or intrinsic (e.g. behaviours) factors that might have made at least some avian groups more capable of overcoming the successful colonization conundrum than others. Such factors need not apply only to oceanic dispersals; indeed, they could apply to any biogeographical distribution that included a sweepstakes barrier for the organism(s) under consideration. Yet, biogeographical studies at various geographical scales (e.g. inter- or intra-continental) of many vertebrate groups have tended to discount the possibility that factors other than shared exposure to single, mainly geologically based, vicariant events might have contributed to common distributions. Pattern-based analyses still dominate historical biogeographical studies, while sweepstake colonization events are almost always trumped by land-based movements at most geographical scales.

Here, we used a molecular phylogeny based on 60 of 65 extant species of Turdus thrushes (Voelker et al., 2007) to determine how Turdus achieved its modern distribution. Because Turdus is almost global in its distribution and because just one recently derived North American species exists, we predicted that sweepstake colonizations might be evident in the history of the group. We employed several methods of ancestral area analysis to reconstruct biogeographical history. We further sought to identify palaecoclimatic events and phylogenetically correlated behavioural traits (here, migratory and flocking behaviour) that might have helped Turdus, and by extension other lineages, overcome the successful colonization conundrum.

METHODS

Phylogenetic reconstruction

Our analyses were based on a maximum likelihood molecular phylogeny of the songbird genus Turdus, detailed descriptions of which have been previously published (Voelker et al., 2007). This analysis included 60 of 65 extant Turdus species, in addition to four species from three genera that were shown to fall within Turdus.

Biogeographical reconstructions

Both parsimony and maximum-likelihood (ML) methods were used to infer ancestral areas for the genus. We used weighted ancestral area analysis (WAAA; Hausdorf, 1998), dispersal-vicariance analysis (DIVA; Ronquist, 1997) and ML methods in the Ancestral States module in mesquite (Maddison & Maddison, 2004) to determine most likely ancestral areas for Turdus at each node. Species were coded in WAAA and mesquite as present or absent in the five major distributional areas of the genus: Africa, Caribbean, Central America, Eurasia and South America. The sole North American species was coded as Central American given its phylogenetic position in that clade. Species were coded in diva, as well as in mesquite, as present or absent in the New and Old Worlds.

Molecular clock dating

Divergence dates were estimated by applying a molecular clock rate to likelihood branch lengths (Sanderson, 2002) generated from cytochrome b data as estimated on the phylogeny (Voelker et al., 2007). The Langley–Fitch method was applied under a truncated Newton algorithm in this analysis. The assignment of an internal calibration point to this analysis was not based on fossils or a standard molecular clock. As is typical for many songbird lineages, useful fossil calibration points are generally lacking for Turdus; the few existing fossils (late Pliocene of Florida) are not identifiable to extant species (Emslie, 1998). A Miocene Turdus humerus was recently used as a calibration point by Nylander et al. (2008); however, this humerus cannot be attributed to any extant species, having been simply designated as the ‘size of iliacus’ (Jánossy, 1991) with no supporting osteological description or measurements. Given that European Turdus fall in to several clades (Voelker et al., 2007) calibrations relying on this Miocene thrush seem tenuous.

In applying a molecular clock, many avian studies have relied on a 2% sequence divergence per million year value around which most calibrations for cytochrome b cluster (Garcia-Moreno, 2004; Ho et al., 2005). The most recent of these studies has supported a generalized 2% divergence rate across a wide range of avian taxa (Weir & Schluter, 2008), but the relevant estimates were all derived using external calibration points (e.g. fossils or geological events). Despite this clustering around 2%, studies (Arbogast & Slowinski, 1998; Garcia-Moreno, 2004) have questioned the validity of the rates even when applied to groups related to lineages initially calibrated (songbirds).
To avoid these issues we assigned an internal calibration point following the lead of Barker et al. (2004; see also Weir & Schluter, 2008) who relied on a geological event to apply a calibration date to a passeriform divergence under the assumption that relevant lineages had experienced this event. Our calibration point was based on the palaeoecology of the equatorial tropical forest of Africa. This forest reached its maximum eastward extent (to the Kenyan coast) between 5 and 3 Ma, after which it began to retract rapidly to the west (Hamilton & Taylor, 1991; Feakins et al., 2005; Sepulchre et al., 2006). We used 3 Ma to date the divergence between the sister taxa Turdus helleri and Turdus abyssicus (Voelker et al., 2007). Turdus helleri is isolated in high-altitude forests in the Eastern Arc Mountains of Kenya, while abyssicus occurs in montane areas north-west of helleri’s range and throughout lowland forest areas of the rift system south to southern Malawi (Collar, 2005). Both species are sedentary (Lens et al., 2002), thus it is a reasonable assumption that these two species are the result of vicariant fragmentation of the habitat of their common ancestor and are not much younger than 3 Ma. We avoided applying other ages due to the various issues surrounding ancestral diversity of lineages and relative population sizes.

**Phylogenetic-behavioural correlations**

Migratory and flocking behaviours were coded as present or absent for each species based on natural history accounts (Clement, 2000; Collar, 2005). Species exhibiting altitudinal migration were considered migratory. Each trait was mapped onto the Turdus phylogeny using parsimony methods (Maddison & Maddison, 1992) and the Ancestral States Module in MESQUITE (Maddison & Maddison, 2004), which reconstructs ancestral character states of continuous (via parsimony) and multistate characters (via parsimony or ML) at all nodes of a phylogeny. We used the appropriate model of character evolution (symmetrical versus asymmetrical) as determined by likelihood ratio tests (LRT). We also tested whether these behavioural traits were phylogenetically correlated using discrete (Pagel, 1994), and a concentrated changes test as implemented in MACCLADE (Maddison & Maddison, 1992).

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

For clarity, biogeographical results and discussion are presented first, alternative phylogenetic and extinction-based hypotheses second and phylogenetic–behavioural correlations third.

**Intercontinental movements and trans-Atlantic sweepstake dispersals**

Overall, ancestral area reconstructions identify a Eurasian ancestral area for Turdus (Fig. 1), but these methods varied in their ability to resolve ancestral distributions at other nodes in the phylogeny. When using the five major distributional regions of Turdus, WAAA (Hausdorf, 1998) provided clear indications of ancestral areas at relevant nodes, while ML analysis (Pagel, 1994; Maddison & Maddison, 2004) did not. Using only New World or Old World as area categories, DIVA (Ronquist, 1997) resolved ancestral areas at most nodes to match the more specific five-region results obtained from WAAA analysis. Movement from the Old World to the New World, with subsequent recolonization of the Old World, is obvious, and five dispersals are required by DIVA to account for current distributions. A similar pattern of movement is evident from ML analysis.

Within Eurasia, a Western Palaearctic origin is most likely, as two of the three oldest extant species are distributed there and the sister genus to Turdus (Psophocichla) is an African endemic (Klicka et al., 2005; Voelker et al., 2007). Our results show that the early lineage diversification of Turdus was achieved by six intercontinental movements, the first having been the colonization of Africa from Eurasia (Figs 1 & 2). Molecular clock dating places this colonization at about 6.6 Ma (Fig. 1). The remaining five intercontinental movements were the result of trans-Atlantic sweepstake dispersals that moved Turdus ancestors directly between the Old World and landmasses around the Caribbean basin (Figs 1 & 2).

The trans-Atlantic dispersals we have inferred from the Turdus phylogeny are notable for three reasons. First, molecular clock dates indicate that the five trans-Atlantic crossings which produced lineages that survive today occurred early and in a narrow temporal window from 5.7–4.7 Ma (Fig. 1). Second, four of these five trans-Atlantic crossings were recolonizations of the Old World from the New World. Third, none of the inferred dispersals between the New and Old Worlds involved trans-Beringian movement, indicating that North America has not been a stepping-stone that contributed to the large Turdus radiations of Eurasia and tropical America (see Fig. 1). Other over-water dispersals have occurred throughout the history of Turdus but these are restricted to continent-to-island, or island-to-island, movements (Fig. 2). While populations of three Old World Turdus species have colonized Iceland or Greenland, there is no evidence of further direct continent-to-continent ocean crossings similar to those concentrated around 5 Ma (Figs 1 & 2).

Dated near the Miocene–Pliocene boundary 5 Ma (Fig. 1), the five trans-Atlantic dispersal events were temporally associated with the closure of the Central American Seaway which began 4.7 Ma (Haug et al., 2001). We found no palaeoclimatic evidence to explain the initial trans-Atlantic dispersal from Africa to the Caribbean basin, although we note that modern Atlantic storm systems are often of such intensity that dust from the Sahara has been recorded in the New World (see Renner, 2004). The inference of colonization of the Caribbean by dispersal from Africa is a novel result for songbirds. Nearly 100% of vertebrate lineages colonizing Caribbean Islands are from New World areas, with North America being the predominant source area for birds (Hedges, 1996).

Molecular clock and palaeoclimatic reconstruction dates suggest that the four trans-Atlantic returns to Eurasia and Africa can be explained by a specific palaeoclimatic regime. Prior to closure of the Central American Seaway, storms formed in the eastern Pacific and Caribbean and moved eastward across the Atlantic (Haug et al., 2001; Zachos et al., 2001; Grodsky et al., 2003; Ravelo et al., 2004; Ravelo & Wara, 2004). This storm pattern would have favoured the transport of Turdus from the Caribbean basin to the Old World, but it was effectively eliminated from...
4.7 Ma when the Central American Seaway was closing due to the uplifting of Central America (Haug et al., 2001; Zachos et al., 2001; Grodsky et al., 2003; Ravelo et al., 2004; Ravelo & Wara, 2004). No subsequent trans-Atlantic dispersals or intra-Caribbean lineage diversification occurred in Turdus after the closure of the Central American Seaway.

**Phylogenetic alternatives**

One potential issue with inferring trans-Atlantic dispersals concerns divergences occurring over a relatively short time span; some of these nodes are where dispersals are inferred. Weak support for relationships could indicate fewer dispersals, but this possibility is unlikely. Analysis of Turdus systematics (Voelker et al., 2007) included assessments of alternative tree topologies (Shimodaira & Hasegawa, 1999). These assessments rejected the possibility of ‘continental’ or ‘regional’ monophyly of Eurasian and Caribbean species in all but one case; in that case (Caribbean clade monophyly; see Fig. 1), the possibility of monophyly was very nearly rejected ($P = 0.056$). This result does not influence our inference of the second trans-Atlantic dispersal.

![Figure 1 Development of biogeographical patterns in Turdus thrushes through time. The tree is a clock enforced maximum-likelihood phylogeny showing the relative timing of lineage divergences. Lineage divergences are based on an assigned calibration date for the helleri–abyssinicus divergence of 3 Ma. Geographical distributions are based on the five major distributional areas of the genus. Ancestral area designations for nodes are based on parsimony and maximum-likelihood reconstructions. Numbered nodes indicate nodes where trans-Atlantic dispersals are inferred.](image-url)
Alternative tree topologies reject other placements of African species in the phylogeny (Shimodaira & Hasegawa, 1999; $P < 0.05$), with the exception of placing pelios as sister to the African clade of five species (Fig. 1; $P = 0.59$). Forcing all African species to be monophyletic is nearly rejected ($P = 0.072$) as a worse estimate of topology by this very conservative test. Combined, these results would still require three (rather than five) trans-Atlantic sweepstake dispersals to explain distributions (dispersals 1, 2, 4).

This level of uncertainty is not surprising due to long branches and short internodes. The reliability of relationships involving long branches and short internodes is often difficult to assess via node-support measures or alternative topologies. Yet for Turdus, accepting alternative relationships of African species requires ignoring the highly supported placement of both pelios within the otherwise exclusively South American clade, and of bewsheri + libonyanus near the base of the phylogeny to the exclusion of other African taxa (Fig. 1; Voelker et al., 2007). Therefore, given the strong support for the placement of African species in the phylogeny, the rejection or near rejection of alternative African species relationships, and that short internodes due to rapid divergence from source populations are expected from sweepstake colonizations (Clegg et al., 2002), our conclusion of five sweepstake dispersals seems reasonable.

Several points are worth making or repeating in the context of phylogenetic structure. First, short internodes are expected if rapid divergence has occurred, and therefore support for those nodes (via bootstrap for example) will be difficult to obtain. Second, mitochondrial genes are the most likely to provide structure at recently diverged nodes (see Zink & Barrowclough, 2008). Coalescent theory clearly argues against a nuclear gene being able to provide support at short internodes, particularly at the relatively recent divergences shown here. Sequencing multiple nuclear genes could possibly provide support (but see Drovetski, 2002), but a large number would need to be sequenced in order to generate the same number of phylogenetically informative sites, and in one striking case 30 nuclear genes provided essentially the same results as a single mitochondrial gene (Jennings & Edwards, 2005). A recent study of Turdus relying heavily on nuclear genes (Nylander et al., 2008) supports these points, as that study, like ours (Voelker et al., 2007), failed to achieve strong support values for at least four deep nodes. This would suggest that these deep nodes are in fact a product of rapid speciation, and not simply a case of mtDNA saturation obfuscating relationships. Thus, mitochondrial genes remain a valid choice for phylogenetic analysis of biogeographical patterns (Zink & Barrowclough, 2008). Third, it is apparent that, given the structure of our Turdus phylogeny (see also Nylander et al., 2008), the inferred trans-
Atlantic dispersal events remain valid even if the assumption of a molecular clock is rejected.

The ghost of extinction

Biogeographical histories of songbird (and other) lineages distributed in both the Old and New Worlds rely heavily on the inference of interchange via Beringia (Mayr, 1946; Voelker, 1999, 2002; Drovettski et al., 2004). Thus, the lack of evidence that North America served to connect the lineages of Turdus in the Old World with those on the land masses surrounding the Caribbean is surprising. Extinction would be the default explanation for North America’s absence in Turdus distributions, but we think it is generally unlikely to have played a significant role. The first crossing of the Atlantic involved movement of an African ancestor to tropical America. Achieving this distribution without invoking a trans-Atlantic dispersal would have required a recolonization of Eurasia from Africa, followed by colonization of North America via Beringia and then colonization of tropical America. This scenario would require the subsequent extinction of an ancestral lineage both in Eurasia and in North America. Following this initial dispersal from Africa to the New World, four dispersals returned Turdus lineages to the Old World from tropical America. Had these distributions instead been accomplished via movement through Beringia, four independent range expansions through North America, followed by colonizations of Asia via Beringia, would have been required. Subsequent extinctions on each continental stepping stone would be required to explain these movements. Further, one of these returns to the Old World (Fig. 2, dispersal 5) requires an additional step from Asia to Africa and an additional extinction in Asia. These simplest-case scenarios assume a minimum number of extinctions; persistence of ancestral lineages in North America or Asia for any length of time would suggest time for speciation, thus increasing the overall number of extinctions that would need to be invoked. Given that several Turdus clades are very speciose (Fig. 1), with species occupying diverse habitats, it is probable that intra-North American speciation would have occurred.

A related consideration involves the long-term persistence in central and eastern Eurasia of species in the large Eurasian clade (Fig. 1; Voelker et al., 2007). Cladogenesis in Eurasia has been generally consistent through time, to include speciation during the Pleistocene (not shown). Therefore, this clade persisted despite repeated near-continent-wide climatic perturbations that altered or shifted habitats (Donghuai et al., 1998; Zhisheng et al., 2001; Guo et al., 2002). This makes it difficult to support rampant extinction in North America, where most habitats persisted through similar climatic perturbations (Webb, 1987; Holliday, 1989, and references therein). Indeed other avian songbird genera of a similar age and with multiple-continent distributions similar to Turdus do have lineages that survived North American glacial cycles (e.g. Voelker, 1999, 2002). The lack of North American colonization from the Central American–Caribbean clade is also relevant here, in that many regions of southern North America were not substantially affected by glacial cycles. This indicates that colonization and speciation should have been possible for millions of years, at least in the southern United States. Yet, excepting the very recently derived but distributionally ubiquitous migratorius, North American colonization is simply not evident in Turdus.

To test the above arguments that extinction is difficult to support, we developed two step matrices in which dispersal and extinction were alternately down-weighted. In the first matrix, extinction was down-weighted four-fold relative to dispersal by forcing a gain of an area to be four times more likely than a loss of an area, while the second matrix down-weights dispersal four-fold by making an area loss four times more likely than a gain. These step-matrices were alternately employed in parsimony-based ancestral character state reconstruction analyses of New World and Old World Turdus species distributions using the Ancestral Character States module in MESQUITE (Maddison & Maddison, 2004). When either extinction (a loss of an area) or dispersal (a gain of an area) is down-weighted with respect to the other, seven (rather than five as in other methods) dispersal events are required to explain Turdus distributions. Given that this analysis used an over-simplified view of distribution pattern (New versus Old World) our assumptions regarding five sweeps free dispersed seems conservative.

In sum, the Beringian connection hypothesis requires a minimum of seven continental extinctions to account for the phylogenetic relationships between Old World and New World Turdus lineages. Given the success of Turdus lineages elsewhere, it is unlikely that some lineage(s) would not have survived in the diverse North American habitats that persisted through glacial periods. Trans-Atlantic dispersals seem far more parsimonious than repeated extinction of lineages across Eurasia and North America, particularly when considered in the context of phylogeny and palaeoclimates.

The role of behaviours in sweepstake dispersal

Vicariance biogeographers have reasonably argued that sweepstake dispersals rarely lead to successful colonizations because they usually involve single, or just a few, individuals (Nelson & Platnick, 1981; Humphries & Parenti, 1999). The most likely post-dispersal fate of these individuals is death without reproduction. We explored this successful colonization conundrum in Turdus by examining the association of migratory and flocking behaviour on the Turdus phylogeny (Appendix S1 in Supporting Information). Both ML and parsimony-based analyses indicate a significant correlation between the two behaviours in Turdus (likelihood ratio test, $P < 0.001$; concentrated changes test, $P = 0.018$). Likelihood results reflect tests of trait dependence versus independence across all species, whereas parsimony results reflect initial gains and losses of traits that preclude large trait-heavy clades from biasing results (e.g. the large Eurasian clade; Figure S1 in Supporting Information). That both analyses are statistically significant suggests that throughout the evolutionary history of Turdus there has been a proclivity for movements by flocks, making successful colonizations following sweepstake dispersal more likely. Recent evidence suggests this could still happen in Turdus (and probably other lineages): fieldfares (Turdus pilaris), which breed almost exclusively in western Eurasia, colonized...
Greenland in a flock early in the last century (Salomonsen, 1950). Palaeoclimatic storm patterns, however, are the key factor that allowed the behavioural correlation to be repeatedly relevant to sweepstake dispersals at the Miocene–Pliocene boundary.

These behavioural–palaeoclimate relationships are broadly significant to studies of sweepstake dispersals. Many lineage-specific studies clearly document, via divergence dates, that dispersal is a plausible mechanism to explain distributions (Raxworthy et al., 2002; Filardi & Moyle, 2005; Heinicke et al., 2007). However, most do not simultaneously attempt to explain how lineages might have overcome the successful colonization conundrum. Instead, we are generally left to assume fortuitous events as explanations; the ability to easily invoke such dispersal events is what has led in part to the ascendance of the alternative paradigm of vicariance. A similar point can be made for vicariance-based explanations that use single events to explain multilineage patterns, even when those lineages include diverse vertebrate taxa with very different behaviours and life histories (e.g. Riddle et al., 2000). The search for pattern still dominates biogeographical inquiry, yet underlying processes can enhance our knowledge of distributional patterns and potentially provide a more realistic view of evolutionary history.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We thank F. K. Barker, R. Dudley, S. Drovetski, J. McGuire, W. Monoham and R. Outlaw for constructive comments. This work was supported in part by a National Science Foundation grant (DEB-9903544 to G.V.).

REFERENCES


SUPPORTING INFORMATION

Additional Supporting Information may be found in the online version of this article:

Figure S1. Reconstruction of migratory and flocking behaviours on a maximum likelihood phylogeny of Turdus thrushes.

Please note: Wiley-Blackwell are not responsible for the content or functionality of any supporting materials supplied by the authors. Any queries (other than missing material) should be directed to the corresponding author for the article.
Gary Voelker was an associate professor at the University of Memphis. He is now Assistant Professor of Wildlife and Fisheries Sciences and Curator of Birds at Texas A&M University.

Sievert Rohwer is Professor and Curator Emeritus at the University of Washington.

Diana Outlaw is a post-doctoral research associate at the University of Missouri-St Louis, where she is studying diversification within and among malarial parasite lineages.

Rauri Bowie is an assistant professor in the Department of Integrative Biology and Curator of Birds at the Museum of Vertebrate Zoology at the University of California-Berkeley. His interests include historical biogeography, disease ecology and speciation processes in birds, with a particular emphasis on African taxa.